

# NORTHWEST TERRITORIES LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

5<sup>th</sup> Session

Day 14

14<sup>th</sup> Assembly

# **HANSARD**

Friday, March 8, 2002

Pages 479 - 506

The Honourable Tony Whitford, Speaker

### **Legislative Assembly of the Northwest Territories**

Members of the Legislative Assembly

### Speaker Hon. Tony Whitford

(Kam Lake)

#### Hon. Stephen Kakfwi

(Sahtu)
Premier
Executive Council
Minister Responsible for
Intergovernmental Affairs
Minister Responsible for the Status of
Women

#### Hon. Jim Antoine

(Nahendeh)

Deputy Premier
Minister of Aboriginal Affairs
Minister Responsible for the
Intergovernmental Forum
Minister of Resources, Wildlife and
Economic Development

#### Hon. Roger T. Allen

(Inuvik Twin Lakes)
Minister of Justice
Minister Responsible for NWT
Housing Corporation
Minister Responsible for Public
Utilities Board
Minister Responsible for Youth

#### Hon. Joseph L. Handley

(Weledeh)

Minister Responsible for Energy and Hydro Secretariats
Minister of Finance
Minister Responsible for the Financial Management Board
Minister Responsible for the Northwest Territories Power Corporation
Minister of Transportation
Minister Responsible for the Workers' Compensation Board

#### Hon. J. Michael Miltenberger

(Thebacha)

Minister of Health and Social Services Minister Responsible for Persons with Disabilities Minister Responsible for Seniors

#### Hon. Jake Ootes

(Yellowknife Centre)
Minister of Education, Culture and
Employment

#### Hon. Vince R. Steen

(Nunakput)

Minister of Public Works and Services Minister of Municipal and Community Affairs

#### Mr. Brendan Bell

(Yellowknife South)

### Mr. Bill Braden

(Great Slave)

### Mr. Paul Delorey

(Hay River North)

#### Mr. Charles Dent

(Frame Lake)

### Mrs. Jane Groenewegen

(Hay River South)

#### Mr. David Krutko

(Mackenzie Delta)

### Mr. Leon Lafferty

(North Slave)

### Ms. Sandy Lee

(Range Lake)

### Mr. Michael McLeod

(Deh Cho)

#### Mr. Steven Nitah

(Tu Nedhe)

#### Mr. Floyd Roland

(Inuvik Boot Lake)

#### **Officers**

#### Clerk of the Legislative Assembly

Mr. David M. Hamilton

**Deputy Clerk**Mr. Doug Schauerte

**Clerk of Committees** 

Law Clerks

Sergeant-at-Arms

**Editors of Hansard** 

Mr. Dave Inch

Ms. Katherine R. Peterson, Q.C. Ms. Nicole Latour-Theede Mr. James R. Posynick

Rich Archer Sue Ireland

Box 1320

Yellowknife, Northwest Territories

Tel: (867) 669-2200 Fax: (867) 920-4735 Toll-Free: 1-800-661-0784

http://www.assembly.gov.nt.ca

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

PRAYER	479
MINISTERS' STATEMENTS	479
31-14(5): MARCH 8, 2002, INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY (KAKFWI)	479
32-14(5): ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ADVISORY FORUM (ANTOINE)	
MEMBERS' STATEMENTS	480
LACK OF CONFIDENCE IN PREMIER KAKFWI (GROENEWEGEN)	480
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF WISE WOMEN AWARD RECIPIENT SUZETTE MONTREUIL (LEE)	
INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY (DELOREY)	
PASSING OF HERBERT LAFFERTY (MILTENBERGER)	
NORTH SLAVE ARCTIC WINTER GAMES PARTICIPANTS (LAFFERTY)	
GATHERING OF ELDERS IN TULITA (KAKFWI)	482
INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY (KRUTKO)	482
PUBLIC HOUSING AND INCOME SUPPORT HARMONIZATION INITIATIVE (MCLEOD)	483
COMMISSION ON THE FUTURE OF HEALTH CARE IN CANADA (B ELL)	483
INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY WOMEN IN GOVERNANCE (BRADEN)	
GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY AND THE PUBLIC INTEREST (ROLAND)	
INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY (DENT)	
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF WISE WOMEN AWARD RECIPIENT ELIZABETH GREENLAND (ALLEN)	
RECOGNITION OF S POUSE THERESA HANDLEY (HANDLEY)	
INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY (ANTOINE)	
RECOGNITION OF LENA PEDERSON (OOTES)	486
RECOGNITION OF VISITORS IN THE GALLERY	486
ORAL QUESTIONS	487
FIRST READING OF BILLS	492
SECOND READING OF BILLS	493
CONSIDERATION IN COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF BILLS AND OTHER MATTERS	493
REPORT OF COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE	505
THIRD READING OF BILLS	505
ORDERS OF THE DAY	505

# YELLOWKNIFE, NORTHWEST TERRITORIES Friday, March 8, 2002

#### **Members Present**

Honourable Roger Allen, Honourable Jim Antoine, Mr. Bell, Mr. Braden, Mr. Delorey, Mr. Dent, Mrs. Groenewegen, Honourable Joe Handley, Honourable Stephen Kakfwi, Mr. Krutko, Mr. Lafferty, Ms. Lee, Mr. McLeod, Honourable Michael Miltenberger, Honourable Jake Ootes, Mr. Roland, Honourable Vince Steen, Honourable Tony Whitford.

#### **ITEM 1: PRAYER**

#### -- Prayer

**SPEAKER (Hon. Tony Whitford):** Thank you. Please be seated. Good morning. Item 2, Ministers' statements. The honourable Premier, Mr. Kakfwi.

#### **ITEM 2: MINISTERS' STATEMENTS**

HON. STEPHEN KAKFWI: Mr. Speaker, International Women's Day is a time when countries around the world, as well as the United Nations, celebrate the successes that women are making to improve the quality of life for all. It is a special time when we in the Northwest Territories look around and see who is making a difference in the lives of our families and in our communities. I want to say thank you and pay tribute to all the women of the Northwest Territories on this special day.

Later today we will be recognizing the recipients of the Wise Women Awards and give them special thanks for their leadership and the personal contributions they have made to better their communities. It is often said that women are the backbone of our communities. It is also because of women in our communities and their advocacy that we continue to see improvements in services for day care, social income support, family law and adoption, education, justice and many other programs.

We also know that there is still much to be done. The Social Agenda Working Group is an important initiative in this regard. There are a number of strong knowledgeable women and men from our communities working together to develop a framework on social issues and to help guide the decision-makers at all levels in making the North a better place in which to live and work

This government has appointed Ministers responsible for Seniors, Youth, Disabilities, Homelessness and Family Violence. In many cases it is women and their organizations who have challenged our government to commit to working together to better understand and serve the people who have not been heard. Northern women continue to participate in the hundreds of boards and agencies across the Northwest Territories, wisely advising all of us to listen and to do what is right for the people of the...

**MR. SPEAKER:** Excuse me, may I interrupt, Mr. Premier. The statement you are making is not the one that was filed with the Speaker, Mr. Premier.

HON. STEPHEN KAKFWI: This is what I have.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Mr. Premier, the Rules of the House are clear that a Minister's statement must be filed with the Speaker prior

to, or you can make an emergency statement only. Mr. Premier, do you have your prepared filed statement?

# Minister's Statement 31-14(5): March 8, 2002, International Women's Day

HON. STEPHEN KAKFWI: Mr. Speaker, today nations around the world are celebrating International Women's Day. It is a day when women and men everywhere rise above their national, ethnic, cultural, economic and political boundaries to celebrate the achievements women have made in improving the quality of life for all.

As we reflect on women's participation at the community level and the work they have done to address social, economic and political issues, it is only fitting, Mr. Speaker, that the theme for this year's International Women's Day is "Working in Solidarity: Women, Human Rights and Peace." This theme recognizes the influence and the crucial role women play in seeking social justice on the local, national and international scenes.

Forgive me, cameraman.

#### -- Laughter

Mr. Speaker, northern women have long been the voice for social justice and for peace in our homes and communities. The discussions we have had in this House on family law, human rights, housing and income support are a culmination of what women in the communities have brought to us as legislators. Mr. Speaker, women have come forward in solidarity, carrying the voices of all peoples who have fought so long and hard for these basic human rights.

Mr. Speaker, this is the 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Status of Women Council's Wise Women Awards. These awards are in recognition of the dedication and service women have given to the communities in which they live. Of the 35 nominations, Mr. Speaker, five women have been selected by members of the Status of Women Council.

It is my privilege to announce to you today the names of this year's Wise Women: Elizabeth Greenland of Inuvik; Terry Villeneuve of Fort Simpson; Suzette Montreuil of Yellowknife; Laura Tobac of Fort Good Hope and Jane Dragon of Fort Smith.

#### -- Applause

Thank you. Mr. Speaker, there will be a celebration luncheon today in the Great Hall in recognition of International Women's Day and to honour today's recipients of the Wise Women Awards. I welcome all Members to attend this important event. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Premier. Item 2, Ministers' statements. The honourable Minister responsible for Aboriginal Affairs, Mr. Antoine.

# Minister's Statement 32-14(5): Economic Development Advisory Forum

**HON. JIM ANTOINE:** Mahsi, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I would like to provide Members with an update on the Economic Development Advisory Forum.

Mr. Speaker, at the initial meeting of the Intergovernmental Forum in May of 2000 in Hay River, leaders identified a number of key issues they wanted to collectively address through the IGF. These issues include devolution and resource revenue sharing, financing of governments, capacity building and economic development. As a reflection of the government-to-government-to-government relationships confirmed through the IGF, Canada, the GNWT and the Aboriginal Summit agreed to establish the Economic Development Advisory Forum at the second meeting of the Intergovernmental Forum in May 2001 in Inuvik.

The advisory forum is mandated to provide advice and recommendations to the IGF on pan-territorial and regional economic development issues. The objectives of the advisory forum are to:

- increase the participation of aboriginal people in economic policies;
- enhance the quality and effectiveness of economic programming in the Northwest Territories;
- provide for NWT input and meaningful participation in the development of federal economic policies;
- find more collaborative approaches in addressing economic development issues; and
- ensure that the decisions made respect cultural diversity, land claims and sustainable development.

Canada, the Aboriginal Summit and the GNWT collaborated on identifying, screening and appointing members to the advisory forum. The parties requested nominations through a variety of processes, including:

- aboriginal governments provided nominations through the Aboriginal Summit;
- MLAs were invited to nominate individuals by letter from my office; and
- advertisements were placed in northern newspapers inviting interested individuals to submit their name.

As a result of this joint selection process, a group of highly skilled and experienced individuals representing a broad cross-section of interests in the Northwest Territories were appointed to serve on the advisory forum when leaders met at the last IGF meeting in Fort Simpson in January.

Mr. Speaker, the first meeting of the advisory forum took place earlier this week in Fort Smith and the members present agreed that it was a productive start. The Honourable Ethel Blondin-Andrew and I had the opportunity to meet with the advisory forum on behalf of the Government of Canada and the Government of the Northwest Territories respectively.

I would like to advise this House that the advisory forum has identified preliminary priorities and has also considered how they will approach their work over the next little while. Some of the preliminary priorities they identified include advocating the development of new funding mechanisms that would lead to additional investments for the North, building business capacity and emphasizing human resource development.

The members present deferred selection of co-chairs until all members can participate in the selection process. Two members of the advisory forum will provide the Intergovernmental Forum with an overview of their work to date at the upcoming IGF meeting in early April.

Mr. Speaker, it is clear from the tone and approach taken already by the advisory forum that they are action-oriented, intent on providing practical, focused advice to the IGF, interested in building on existing strategies and reluctant to "reinvent the wheel". I look forward to the advice the members of the advisory forum will provide to Canada, the Aboriginal Summit and the GNWT through the IGF. Mahsi, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Mahsi, Mr. Antoine. Item 2, Ministers' statements. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Hay River South, Mrs. Groenewegen.

#### **ITEM 3: MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

### Member's Statement on Lack of Confidence in Premier Kakfwi

MRS. GROENEWEGEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, this is probably one of the most difficult Member's statements I have ever had to make, and I have had to make a few tough ones during my six years in this Legislature.

Mr. Speaker, issues have come to light in the media, and will further come to light later as we consider the upcoming supplementary appropriation, which will detail the actions on the part of our Premier which will demonstrate, in my opinion, that he lacks sound judgment.

Mr. Speaker, in the fallout after the Special Committee on Conflict Process, I was faced with a moral conflict between personal loyalty to someone I cared about and public accountability for upholding a high standard of integrity as elected officials. Not certain of my motives in the confusion and wake of a very stressful time, I chose personal loyalty.

In the weeks and months subsequent to that I have had the opportunity to reassess my decision many times and still was able to rationalize my choice to support the Premier on the grounds that we needed to move forward, be positive, understanding that we are all human and sometimes we do things that show poor judgment.

Numerous times I have requested of the Premier an opportunity to sit down and fully discuss the details of what

transpired around the circumstances that gave rise to the inquiry by the special committee. In a way, I guess, I hoped he had not been previously aware of them and maybe had been the victim of being kept in the dark, but he has never wanted to know.

I wanted to apologize to the people of the Northwest Territories and my colleagues in this House, as a person who puts so much on the line to stand up for transparent and accountable government in the 13<sup>th</sup> Assembly, for allowing my personal loyalty and affection to so cloud my judgment that I would want to ignore the facts of actions that were taken, which go to the very heart of the integrity of this government.

As long as those things stay hidden and unaccounted for, nothing can really be right. After receiving a vote of confidence in this House to continue on as Premier, Mr. Kakfwi has unfortunately continued to display an attitude of arrogance and disregard for the position of authority that he holds.

In light of what transpired prior to that confidence vote and what has transpired since, I feel it is incumbent on me today to stand up in this House and say that regardless of how these issues are disposed of by other Members of this House, personally I have no confidence in Stephen Kakfwi as the Premier of the Northwest Territories. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mrs. Groenewegen. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Range Lake, Ms. Lee.

#### Member's Statement on Acknowledgement of Wise Women Award Recipient Suzette Montreuil

MS. LEE: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, this year marks the tenth anniversary of the Wise Women Awards, which we will celebrate later today in the Great Hall. One of the recipients of the award is Ms. Suzette Montreuil of Yellowknife. Recently, I had an opportunity to provide my opinion on the work and the contribution that Ms. Montreuil made to our city and the Territories.

In honour of all men and women in the Territories who work on behalf of women's issues, I would like to just share with the House what I said about what Ms. Montreuil has done to improve the lives of women in our community.

Ms. Montreuil has made enormous contributions to our community in various capacities. In the process, she has improved the lives of many, especially women in our community and throughout the North. She is well known for her involvement for providing constructive critique of social and economic policies. She has assisted in numerous loving efforts for social agencies, labour organizations and environmental groups and has participated in an extensive review of the GNWT's budget process.

She is a woman of many talents. Whether she is performing a song, reading a poem or making presentations to various levels of governments for policy changes, her conviction and clarity in thinking comes through and forces the audience to take notice of her argument and her cause.

Her powerful presentations based on strong analytical skills forces decision makers and the general public to rethink the way things are done and where the priorities are being placed on various issues such as poverty, family violence, income tax

system, day care and independent schools for the Francophone.

I have also seen this in her work on behalf of the front-line health care providers and on behalf of the labour movement in the North, where she consistently displays the same strength and impact on public policy.

Having observed her work and read her writings, I believe she is one of the strongest minds and clearest thinkers in the North today. While this may appear to be an intangible work, I believe strongly that Ms. Montreuil's contribution to our northern society is invaluable and highly important in creating a society that is more broad minded and just.

I have no doubt that through her work over the many years she has improved the lives of all women as well as men. I would like to recognize her and all other women who do the same. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Ms. Lee. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Hay River North, Mr. Delorey.

#### Member's Statement on International Women's Day

**MR. DELOREY:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I rise today to raise awareness of a very important week, International Women's Week, which is being celebrated throughout the world this week and in particular, International Women's Day being held today, March 8<sup>th</sup>.

The theme for this year's International Women's Day is "Working in Solidarity: Women, Human Rights and Peace." Mr. Speaker, this theme captures and serves to recognize the crucial role that women play in seeking social justice on the local, regional, national and international stages.

It also reinforces, Mr. Speaker, the critical need for all of us to work further to address the abuse of human rights, which was brought more sharply into focus in the wake of the September 11<sup>th</sup> tragedy when we were all faced with the atrocities faced by Afghan women.

Mr. Speaker, I believe that we as a society have come a long way in recognizing and placing value on the rights of women but there is more work to be done. Equal rights for women, Mr. Speaker, are essential to advancing the progress on human rights and democratic development. We must strive to advance gender equality.

Mr. Speaker, I give tremendous credit to the people, both women and men, who are working on the front lines in dealing with the aftermath of abuse against women, many times under very trying circumstances.

Mr. Speaker, I would like to highlight some activities that the Family Support Centre in Hay River is planning for the celebration of International Women's Day today. The Family Support Centre, Mr. Speaker, is hosting a celebration of women this evening. This will encompass music, singing, ethnic and cultural dance, drumming, poetry and, of course, socializing.

Mr. Speaker, I commend the Family Support Centre and the Status of Women's Council of the Northwest Territories, not only for the work they have done in preparing this celebration for International Women's Week but for their tireless work throughout the year in promoting the cause of women. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Delorey. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Thebacha, Mr. Miltenberger.

#### Member's Statement on Passing of Herbert Lafferty

**HON. MICHAEL MILTENBERGER:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I have a friend. His name is Herbert Lafferty. He is about my age. He is going to school in Ottawa with his wife and his children. I have known Herbert for almost 40 years. I came to know him when we both arrived in Fort Smith back in the very early 60s to go to school. We stayed at Grandin College.

Over the years we have stayed in touch. Some of his family continues to live in Fort Smith. Herbert chose to further his education. He worked across the North. He has great skill as a musician and is well known in musical circles.

Today, I just wanted to state that fact, because about a week ago, he passed away very suddenly and unexpectedly. I just thought it would be appropriate for the first time in six years to pay tribute to Herbert. His brother Mel is here in the gallery. He was my friend. He was a friend of many. He went to school with some of us. I wanted to offer my condolences to the family as well. Thank you.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Miltenberger. Indeed, condolences. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for North Slave, Mr. Lafferty.

### Member's Statement on North Slave Arctic Winter Games Participants

MR. LAFFERTY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. My statement today is on the Arctic Winter Games. I would like to congratulate all of the athletes that are going to the games. Also, I would like to congratulate my constituents, the girls under-14 soccer team. The team consists of Antonia Gramiak, Krista Mantla, Samantha Migwi and Rena Lafferty. They have picked up some players from around the Territories to make up the rest of the team.

Also, I would like to congratulate the juvenile boys under-14 soccer team. The constituents of mine are Donavon Bishop, Marvin Migwi, Marvis Migwi, Tyron Fish and Rusty Mantla.

Mr. Speaker, I would like to say that in the past, we have been here in the House and spoke of unfairness in the selection process for our sports teams. Rae-Edzo sets a very good example of how a team should be made up. They do that by showing that they can make a team and make it out of the whole Territories by selecting other communities. They even go to Yellowknife to select their teams, Fort Simpson and other areas. This shows the sportsmanship and the commitment they put to representing the Northwest Territories.

I would like to tell the rest of the Northwest Territories that Rae-Edzo is a good example and the rest of the Territories should be using that kind of example for their games for the future. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Lafferty. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Sahtu, Mr. Kakfwi.

#### Member's Statement on Gathering of Elders in Tulita

HON. STEPHEN KAKFWI: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, while we go about our business here in the Legislature as Members, it is important to recognize that life goes on for everyone else in the communities. This week, there has been a meeting of elders in my constituency of Tulita. They sent me a personal invitation to attend. The messages have been that they very much wanted to see me personally at the gathering.

I have looked at every which way to be there, but because of ongoing internal turmoil and issues here amongst Members with myself, and those things that we think are priorities, it has not been possible to accept the invitation. It has not been possible to attend this gathering.

I have sent a message to them this morning that will be read to them. As the Sahtu MLA, I have sent a message to them that the values they hold are strong, and the wisdom they have to enjoy and cherish those things the Creator has provided for us are those things that will give us, those who follow them, the strength to meet the challenges of the future. Their prayers, wise words and kind actions are our teachers. We must not forget them as we walk our path together. We should remember to work hard to keep our land, our language and our lives strong.

I hope they have a wonderful celebration as they honour the elders in Tulita today. Thank you.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Kakfwi. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Mackenzie Delta, Mr. Krutko.

#### Member's Statement on International Women's Day

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I too would like to comment on International Women's Day. Mr. Speaker, we have some pretty prominent women out there, people such as Ethel Blondin-Andrew and Nellie Cournoyea, who is recognized as one of the top 50 prominent people in Canada. In our communities, we have mayors such as Evelyn Storr of Aklavik and Ethel Blake of Fort McPherson. People within our band councils, our sub-chiefs, such as Hazel Nerysoo, and the many councillors and members of our communities who serve within our public service, especially in the public service in this government. Individuals such as Pauline Gordon of Aklavik, who is an assistant deputy minister. Hopefully she will be reinstated sooner rather than later.

Mr. Speaker, there are many, many women within our public service who work to make the lives better for us in the Northwest Territories. They provide programs and services on

behalf of this government. Again, Mr. Speaker, we have to do more to ensure that women in government reflect the women in our society.

Mr. Speaker, our children are an important part of who we are, but it is our mothers, our sisters who make lives better for all people in the North. I think we have to give a big thank you to the many women who stay home, raise their families, raise their children and make lives better for their children, their family and our communities.

Mr. Speaker, many times we forget about those people who continue to make our communities a better place to live; our mothers, our sisters and our daughters. Mr. Speaker, I think we have to look at where we have gone with women in our society and we still have a long way to go.

The world is a better place because of the actions that we see and the prominence of women in our society. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

-- Applause

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Deh Cho, Mr. McLeod.

### Member's Statement on Public Housing and Income Support Harmonization Initiative

MR. MCLEOD: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, once again I want to state that as part of Towards a Better Tomorrow, we stated that we were aiming for housing that was adequate, affordable and suitable, elders who were well supported by their community and able to live independently.

Once again, I want to repeat that the public housing and income support harmonization initiative does not support either of these stated goals by this government. Many of my colleagues and I have already pointed out that this initiative was poorly planned and communicated to most of our residents, especially to those in public housing.

What I find most distressing about this program is that it fails to address the true issue facing those in public housing in these communities. Those critical issues are of the unsuitability and inadequacy of their homes.

Mr. Speaker, in the year 2000, the Northwest Territories Housing Corporation conducted a housing needs survey. In that survey, the larger communities of Yellowknife, Hay River, Inuvik and Fort Smith identified affordability as a major housing issue. However, the other communities, the other 29 communities of the Northwest Territories, only two percent in public housing identified affordability as a problem for them.

The government has gone through great trouble to show that the majority of the rents will be decreasing as a result of the harmonization package. However, they are still ignoring the fact that 19 percent of the people in public housing have stated that suitability, the number of bedrooms in their homes and how many people squeeze into one room is their biggest concern.

The adequacy of their housing is the most important issue. In two of my ridings, Mr. Speaker, Kakisa and Enterprise, over 40 percent of the homes require major renovations, including

plumbing, heating and/or electrical systems. These stats are all from the Northwest Territories Housing Corporation's own housing needs survey.

Mr. Speaker, what is the point of the Housing Corporation going out and asking these questions in a survey if they are not even going to listen to the answers? The communities have answered loud and clear, Mr. Speaker. For those in public housing, affordability is not the issue. Safe and healthy homes for our people is the issue.

Mr. Speaker, given the poor way in which this harmonization program was developed and communicated, and given the fact that it does not begin to touch the more important housing issues, I recommend that this government scrap this initiative...

**MR. SPEAKER:** Mr. McLeod, your time for your Member's statement has ended. Mr. McLeod.

**MR. MCLEOD:** Mr. Speaker, I seek unanimous consent to conclude my statement.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you. The honourable Member is seeking unanimous consent to conclude his statement. Are there any nays? There are no nays. You may conclude your statement. Mr. McLeod.

MR. MCLEOD: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I will just repeat the last part of my statement. Mr. Speaker, given the poor way in which this harmonization program was developed and communicated, and given the fact that it does not begin to touch the more important public housing issues in the Northwest Territories, I recommend that this government scrap this initiative and start working on something that will benefit all Northwest Territories citizens. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

-- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. McLeod. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Yellowknife South, Mr. Bell.

### Member's Statement on Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada

MR. BELL: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Two weeks ago I made a statement in the House regarding the Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada and the need for Northerners to get involved, especially in the scheduled hearings in Yellowknife on May 16<sup>th</sup>. I rise again today to speak on the same issue.

Over the next few months the commission will be hosting public hearings all across Canada, Mr. Speaker, and the purpose of these hearings is to listen to Canadians and to hear what they have to say about the future of our current health care system.

We are fortunate that the commission is coming north on May 16, 2002, and will be hearing from us, the people of the North. I wanted to bring these hearings to the attention of this House and stress to the people of the North how important this is to our health care system. It is indeed a unique opportunity to provide input into what we view should be our future national health system.

Yesterday, Mr. Speaker, the Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada announced the release of a

consultation workbook. It is designed to give Canadians an opportunity to provide their views on what direction they see the future of health care taking. This workbook is available to every Canadian online, Mr. Speaker, so that we can submit our views to the commission.

The workbook takes approximately 15 minutes to complete and asks for input on four possible scenarios to address health care sustainability. The four scenarios are:

- 1. more public investment;
- more co-payments and cost sharing;
- increased private choice: and
- reorganized service delivery.

Additional information and reference material is provided, so if you do not have a full understanding of the options, a reference is available. The scenarios also provide potential positive and negative impacts that will have to be considered.

Mr. Speaker, the purpose of my statement today is quite simple. I urge everyone with a vested interest in our health care system to get involved, whether it be through a presentation in May to the commission or by simply logging on to the commission's website and taking the 15 minutes required to give the commission your views. Your input is critical to the shape of our health care system in Canada.

For your interest, Mr. Speaker, the work book can be downloaded at www.healthcarecommission.ca. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Bell. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Great Slave, Mr. Braden.

# Member's Statement on International Women's Day Women in Governance

MR. BRADEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, recognizing today is International Women's Day, I too would like to add some comment. I would like to reflect on this institution and those of every other elected office in the Northwest Territories and Canada.

Mr. Speaker, considering the significance and importance of women in elected office and in governments, I think it is especially fitting that one of the recipients from Yellowknife, Ms. Suzette Montreuil, was an opponent of mine, and a very formidable and a very worthy opponent, and she is indeed deserving of this recognition.

Having women represented at all levels of governance, I think, Mr. Speaker, is essential to the balance of decision making that we all undertake and the tone and the clarity of the work that we do. I think if we reflect back on our Youth Parliament last month, it seems to me that overwhelmingly, the number of representatives here from among the youth were young women. That gives me great hope that we will be seeing these young people, and others like them who follow their roles and their leadership, taking part in elected governments across the North.

I would like to take this opportunity to encourage women to consider, whenever the opportunity comes up, to run for elected office, whether it is at the school board level, municipal level, band council level, the territorial level, even the federal level, to bring that balance up to where it should be.

I guess in that light, Mr. Speaker, I am hoping and wondering if we will ever see the day when International Women's Day will not be needed because we will be able to see that it is a quaint idea, a throw-back to an age when women were not reflected in their rightful place in society, and that they indeed have the representation and the role they should have. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Braden. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Inuvik Boot Lake, Mr. Roland.

### Member's Statement on Government Accountability and the Public Interest

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, as I start with my Member's statement, I would like to send greetings back to my wife, who has been a solid supporter behind me and helped me to stand in this place and speak to the many issues I have raised in this House around accountability and what we have done as a government, and how we present ourselves to the public. It is nice to know that I have that support, Mr. Speaker.

Mr. Speaker, once again I find myself standing in this House and referring to our actions as government and how the people would view us, and how we uphold our commitment to be an honest and transparent government and carry on business that would be seen as being in the best public interest. After all, Mr. Speaker, that is why many of us stood up and took the challenge to run in elections to be representatives for the people in the Northwest Territories.

Mr. Speaker, once again I find myself raising the issue of accountability as a government. The decisions we make, are they in the best interest of government or of the people, or of ourselves as individuals? Mr. Speaker, at times when we get so busy and we are wrapped up in the work around us and the many documents and papers that come forward to our desks, we sometimes forget why we are sitting here, why we came in and what the purpose was for our wanting to be here.

Mr. Speaker, later today in the House, during committee of the whole, there is an issue that will again be raised about how we as a government take care of the public interest and how we spend government dollars to benefit the people of the Northwest Territories. Mr. Speaker, on the issue of accountability and how we represent the people, I am hoping that this government, the ones we have chosen to lead us as Cabinet Ministers and the Executive Council, will be forthright with the people of the Territories, and will be open and accountable and transparent as to what they have put forward in decisions they have made. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Frame Lake, Mr. Dent.

#### Member's Statement on International Women's Day

MR. DENT: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, Mr. Speaker, today I rise in recognition of International Women's Day. Mr. Speaker, this is a day to recognize the accomplishments of women and reflect on the challenges that still lie ahead. Unfortunately, Mr. Speaker, there are still far too many challenges. Family violence and violence against women are still among the biggest.

Mr. Speaker, in my constituency there is a women's shelter called the Alison McAteer House. In spite of our public pronouncements in support of zero tolerance for violence, shelters like the Alison McAteer House are busier than ever all of the time, year-round. Mr. Speaker, we must do more to stop violence. One of the most important steps we could take in this Legislative Assembly would be to move quickly to enact a family violence protection act. This would act as an important tool to allow women who are victims to stay in their homes in their home communities, where they have better support networks. Mr. Speaker, I hope we can see such a bill introduced in June.

Mr. Speaker, I would also like to congratulate the Status of Women Council for the Northwest Territories on their Wise Women Awards Program. It is important to celebrate and recognize those who are leaders in their communities and in the North. I would like to also extend my congratulations to the winners this year, especially Suzette Montreuil, who resides in my constituency. As Ms. Lee and Mr. Braden have already spoken about Ms. Montreuil, I think Members can see that her award is well-deserved. I look forward to attending the awards ceremony in the Great Hall today. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Dent. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes, Mr. Allen

#### Member's Statement on Acknowledgement of Wise Women Award Recipient Elizabeth Greenland

HON. ROGER ALLEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, today on behalf of my colleague, Floyd Roland, Member for Inuvik Boot Lake, I would like to take this opportunity to honour an individual who was nominated for this year's Wise Women Awards. The criteria for judging the Wise Women Award winners is based on dedication and commitment to the community, benefits they have brought to women and/or to the community as a whole, and the positive role model they present to other women.

This year's winner for the Mackenzie Delta is Mrs. Elizabeth Greenland of Inuvik. Mrs. Greenland has devoted her life to teaching children dance since the early 1970s and at 81 years of age, she is still willing to teach. Elizabeth has also told many stories from the wisdom she has gained from living out on the land and from being a strong member of her church. She tries to keep the Gwich'in language alive by teaching her own children, grandchildren and others as well. She is an amazing woman, amazing mother, community leader and elder.

The award ceremony will take place during the International Women's Day luncheon on March  $8^{\rm h}$  in the Great Hall of the Legislative Assembly. Mr. Speaker, on behalf of Mr. Roland and myself, I would like to ask the Members of this Legislative

Assembly to help me congratulate Mrs. Greenland and the other recipients of this prestigious award. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Allen. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Weledeh, Mr. Handley.

### Member's Statement on Recognition of Spouse Theresa Handley

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Today, Friday, March 8, 2002, International Women's Day, I want to acknowledge the contribution made by all women around the world to the betterment of ourselves. In particular, I want to congratulate the women who have received the Status of Women Council Wise Women Awards in the past and those who are receiving the awards today.

I want to give a special appreciation to one woman, with whom I entered into a negotiated, sole-sourced contract 36 years, six months, 15 days and about 20 hours ago.

#### -- Laughter

We have been through a lot of smooth water and a few storms. She can stir one up pretty quick if I get out of line. She is certainly one person who can get my attention very quickly right now if I get out of line. It is very clear to her that I may be Government House Leader, but that does not apply at home. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Handley. At the appropriate time, I am sure you will identify that individual to the House. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Nahendeh, Mr. Antoine.

#### Member's Statement on International Women's Day

**HON. JIM ANTOINE:** Mahsi, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I would also like to stand here today as the MLA for Nahendeh to say a few words about International Women's Day. The reason for the celebration is to celebrate the achievements women have made in improving the quality of life for all.

I must say that looking at that reason for the recognition, there are many women throughout my life who have contributed greatly to our communities. They are still contributing into our communities in different levels and different ways. For myself, I just wanted to recognize my grandmother and my mother, who have gone ahead of us. The teachings they have given me, my brothers and sisters and our cousins are still with us today to guide us in how we conduct ourselves and how we carry ourselves.

As well, they were an example to be followed. That, amongst other things, has lead to help other people in our communities to try and improve the day-to-day quality of life. I would like to recognize all of the women in our communities who are chiefs, councillors or mayors, and the front-line workers helping our communities. I would like to say mahsi and thank you very much

Also today, since there is the Wise Women Awards, I would like to congratulate all of the women who have been nominated and selected by their peers. I especially wanted to recognize Terry Villenueve of Fort Simpson. She has contributed to her community in many ways on a spiritual level, in trying to make life better for our community in that regard. She is a good example for people and a positive role model. I would like to congratulate her for winning this award on behalf of Fort Simpson. Mahsi.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Antoine. Item 3, Members' statements. The honourable Member for Yellowknife Centre, Mr. Ootes

#### Member's Statement on Recognition of Lena Pederson

HON. JAKE OOTES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. In this day, it is really a special privilege for me to be able to recognize someone who many, many years ago made a great contribution to this particular institution. It was the Council of the Northwest Territories, as it was known in those days, some 32 years ago. A person who became, and she should be marked down in history for this, the first female elected in our Legislature to the Council of the Northwest Territories, the predecessor of this Legislative Assembly. It was Lena Pederson from Kuglugtuk who represented the Central Arctic. We are very privileged to have her with us today. It is a great day of distinction to have her here.

In those days, Mr. Speaker, the Council of the Northwest Territories was a little different than the makeup today. I believe it was nine Members and Lena was the second Member for the Central Arctic but, as I say, the first female representative ever of the Council of the Northwest Territories.

The history of the Council of the Northwest Territories, you must remember, goes back to the Assembly of the Assiniboines, which is almost older than the Parliament of Canada. It has great history, on our part, to have someone with us today who brings that distinction.

I understand she is getting an award today. I will not say what that award is, and she is aware of that, but Lena, we congratulate you for that. She is with us today with her daughter Nina, who is from Edmonton, as well as Peggy Welch. Please help me congratulate Lena for being with us here today and for the work that she did...

- -- Applause
- ... as the first female representative.
- -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Ootes. Item 3, Members' statements. Item 4, returns to oral questions. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery.

#### ITEM 5: RECOGNITION OF VISITORS IN THE GALLERY

MR. SPEAKER: Colleagues, it does give me a great deal of pleasure indeed to recognize a former Member of the Assembly, the 7 Council from the years 1970 to 1975, Ms. Lena Pederson.

#### -- Applause

As well, colleagues, I take this opportunity to recognize in the gallery the deputy commissioner, Mr. Cal Mains.

#### Applause

Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Sahtu, Mr. Kakfwi.

HON. STEPHEN KAKFWI: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would like to recognize some special visitors in the House today. First of all, the board members and the staff of the Status of Women's Council. Vi Beck, Harriet Geddes, Theresa Etchinelle, Jean Ekpakohak, Tessi Gonzales, Lynn Brooks, Barbara Saunders, Theresa Handley and Roslind Minault.

I also want to recognize the recipients of the Wise Women Awards. Elizabeth Greenland of Inuvik, Laura Tobac of Fort Good Hope, Jane Dragon of Fort Smith, Terry Villenueve of Fort Simpson and Suzette Montreuil of Yellowknife.

Mr. Speaker, I want to recognize these special women who are in the Legislature with us today. Thank you.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Kakfwi. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Weledeh, Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Further to my Member's statement, I would like to recognize my wife, Theresa. Thank you.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Of whom you spoke so eloquently. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Hay River North, Mr. Delorey.

MR. DELOREY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I would like to recognize a constituent of mine, Tessi Gonzales, who is in the gallery today and is also with the Status of Women's Council. I would also like to recognize a young lady up in the gallery who is a real workhorse, that is Paula, my assistant from Hay River, who has come over and is a great help to me.

I would also like to take this opportunity, Mr. Speaker, to recognize two very special grade 8 students from Hay River North who have been pages in the Legislative Assembly here all week. I want to commend them on a very good job and on how well-behaved they have been all week. I would like to recognize Carrie Williams and Kyle Gibb.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Delorey. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes, Mr. Allen.

HON. ROGER ALLEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It gives me great honour this morning to recognize Ms. Elizabeth Greenland, her son William and her daughter Laurie. Welcome to the gallery. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Allen. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Mackenzie Delta, Mr. Krutko.

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, it gives me great pleasure to have an opportunity to acknowledge Ms. Greenland. I have a lot of respect for her for what she has done, not only for the Gwich'in culture but for providing and promoting our culture. Also with the dances she has been helping the younger people to learn, dances we have praised for years in the North. Most importantly, being a mother who we all wish for in regard to the many, many children and grandchildren she has raised, as well as being a great-great-grandmother.

I think it is important at this time to thank her for that while I have this opportunity. With that, I would also like to recognize Mr. Lee Selleck. It is nice to see you back in the House, Lee. I hope you can stick around.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Nunakput, Mr. Steen.

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I would like to recognize as well Jean Ekpakohak from Holman. Jean is serving her second term as a member of the Status of Women Council.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Steen. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Range Lake, Ms. Lee.

MS. LEE: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, on this day, International Women's Day, and as one of two women Members sitting in this House, I would like to recognize the first woman elected to the Legislature some 30 years ago and the first one to lead, the number I could count is about eight women elected officials who sat around this table, and she was the first. I would like to recognize Lena Pederson. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Ms. Lee. Thirty-two years ago history was made. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Thebacha, Mr. Miltenberger.

**HON. MICHAEL MILTENBERGER:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, I would like to recognize two people. One is a recipient of one of the Wise Women Awards, Jane Dragon, who also made this fine jacket that I have had the privilege of wearing the last number of years. As well, my friend, Mel Lafferty. Thank you.

#### -- Applause

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Miltenberger. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. The honourable Member for Nahendeh, Mr. Antoine.

HON. JIM ANTOINE: Mahsi, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, it gives me great pleasure to recognize a constituent of Fort

Simpson and a recipient of the Wise Women Award this year, Terry Villenueve.

#### -- Applause

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Antoine. Item 5, recognition of visitors in the gallery. I would like to say welcome to all the people who have come to see their Assembly today. Welcome. Item 6, oral questions. The honourable Member for Deh Cho, Mr. McLeod.

#### **ITEM 6: ORAL QUESTIONS**

#### Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

MR. MCLEOD: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I want to resume my line of questioning from committee of the whole to the Minister of MACA with respect to the Arctic Winter Games. In the discussion yesterday, he indicated that he has not been doing any promotion of the Arctic Winter Games. However, he is attending the opening of the Games in Iqaluit and also in Nuuk. I would like to ask the Minister if he will be performing any official duties, either himself or the Minister of Education, Culture and Employment, Mr. Ootes.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. McLeod. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Return to Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, if I understand the question correctly, the Member is asking if I will be taking part in the awards at the Arctic Winter Games. Mr. Speaker, I intend to take part in the awarding of the medals at the Arctic Winter Games in Nuuk, and I believe Mr. Ootes was planning to take part in the cultural aspect.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. McLeod.

### Supplementary to Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

MR. MCLEOD: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is good to hear that the Minister will be doing some promotion, even if it is only awarding medals. However, could he tell us what the cost will be? Yesterday he indicated to us that he would be taking a private jet from Yellowknife to Iqaluit, from Iqaluit to Nuuk and then from Nuuk back to either Inuvik or Yellowknife. I believe the jet will be a Challenger 2. Could he tell me how much it is going to cost for him to fly to give out medals in Nuuk?

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. McLeod. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

# Further Return to Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I believe the quote we received for that jet, depending on which route it flew, including fuel, was about \$34,000. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. McLeod.

### Supplementary to Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

MR. MCLEOD: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, I did not hear it quite right. I am sure he said \$34,000. I believe the jet can accommodate eight passengers. Yesterday I asked the Minister twice if he could tell me who those people would be and he could not tell me as it was not confirmed yet. I am sure he must have a tentative list of people that will be attending. Could he let the House know who will be going?

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. McLeod. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Further Return to Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, as I indicated yesterday, it was up to the two Ministers, myself and Mr. Ootes, as to who would be accompanying us on this flight. At that time we had not decided who would be taking part on the flight. The situation has not changed as of now, so we still do not know who is going to take part in the flight. Thank you.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Minister. Final supplementary, Mr. McLeod.

# Supplementary to Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

MR. MCLEOD: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is my understanding that both Ministers are planning to take their families and their staff, and there really is no opportunity for anyone else to attend, especially Regular MLAs. Could the Minister confirm whether the Ministers will be taking their families and their staff?

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. McLeod. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Further Return to Question 175-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Official Duties

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, that was part of the plan but at this point in time, it has not been confirmed if all the staff or families are going, or even if both Ministers are going. That has not been resolved at this point. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Item 6, oral questions. The honourable Member for Mackenzie Delta, Mr. Krutko.

### Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, in recognition of International Women's Day, I made reference to certain individuals in my statement. I referenced the assistant deputy minister of Education and how, with her 24 years of hard work in the area of education, she has made her way up to the position of assistant deputy minister. However, for some misfortune, she was reprimanded, laid off or suspended. I

would like to ask the Minister, when will Ms. Pauline Gordon be reinstated and back at work in her office?

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Education, Culture and Employment, Mr. Ootes.

### Return to Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

**HON. JAKE OOTES:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, she was not laid off from the territorial government and the process is underway now. The parties agreed to a process and that is happening yesterday and today. I expect the individual will be back at her position next week. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Krutko.

# Supplementary to Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

**MR. KRUTKO:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, could I receive a guarantee on that?

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Education, Culture and Employment, Mr. Ootes.

### Further Return to Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

HON. JAKE OOTES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Certainly I do not control the public service process. However, Mr. Speaker, I have been told that everything is on stream, work is proceeding today and yesterday, and that plans are to have the individual back in the department next week. Presumably, I can only go by the fact that this will be proceeded with efficiently and accordingly, Mr. Speaker. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Krutko.

# Supplementary to Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, the Minister makes a lot of assurances but he has not clearly stated whether there is a guaranteed date when she will be back at work next week. Is that guaranteed or are we talking about another long-term delay? The original delay was three months. We are going into the fourth month now. How long is this delay?

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Education, Culture and Employment, Mr. Ootes.

# Further Return to Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

**HON. JAKE OOTES:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I can only go by what I am told by our public service people, Mr. Speaker. I understand the plan is, if things work out, the individual is to be back in the position next week. There is no reason to think that will not happen. Thank you.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Minister. Final supplementary, Mr. Krutko

### Supplementary to Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, the Minister made a comment, "if things turn out." What type of things is he talking about that have to turn out, and in whose favour? Is it the favour of the Minister, the department, or the favour of the individual who has been suspended or laid off? Who does it have to favour when trying to get this person back to work, yourself as the Minister or the department?

**MR. SPEAKER:** I will just caution the Member to be careful on the words there. The first part of your question was probably the best part. Mr. Minister, you can choose whatever part you want to answer from that question. Mr. Minister.

# Further Return to Question 176-14(5): Reinstatement of Assistant Deputy Minister

HON. JAKE OOTES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. We do not have the right to politically interfere here, Mr. Speaker, so it has been left with the individual and with the people handling this from the public service side. The senior deputy minister is acting as the liaison on this.

I understand that everything is on stream, Mr. Speaker, to have the individual back in her position, I expect early to mid-next week. That is what I have been told, Mr. Speaker. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Item 6, oral questions. The honourable Member for Inuvik Boot Lake, Mr. Roland.

#### Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, my question at this time is directed to the Minister responsible for the Housing Corporation. In this House the previous week, the Minister said a decision would be made by Thursday of this week as to what would happen with the harmonization plan. I would like to have the Minister confirm if in fact that decision has been made.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Roland. The honourable Minister responsible for the NWT Housing Corporation, Mr. Allen.

### Return to Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

**HON. ROGER ALLEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Unfortunately, as of this date, we have not determined the process we are going to use. However, our intention is still to defer the harmonization policy until our projected date of October 1, 2002. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Roland.

# Supplementary to Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Is that the intention for delaying implementation? May we have some more detail on that? Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Roland. The honourable Minister responsible for the NWT Housing Corporation, Mr. Allen.

### Further Return to Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

**HON. ROGER ALLEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The problem with the current document is the fact that we had evaluated and acknowledged the problems with the implementation. We are still trying to work out some of the details on how we want to proceed further with this document. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Roland.

### Supplementary to Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Can the Minister inform us as to when a decision would be made on this issue? Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Roland. The honourable Minister responsible for the NWT Housing Corporation, Mr. Allen

### Further Return to Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

**HON. ROGER ALLEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I have been assured by my department staff that the document is en route to myself for final review. As soon as that is done, I am prepared to share some of our pre-conceptual ideas on how we want to implement this. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Minister. Final supplementary, Mr. Roland.

### Supplementary to Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. When the Minister has that, will he be scheduling a formal meeting with committees, passing that information on to Members or coming through this House? Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Roland. The honourable Minister responsible for the NWT Housing Corporation, Mr. Allen.

# Further Return to Question 177-14(5): Status of Harmonization Plan

**HON. ROGER ALLEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I understand that I will be sharing this document with my Cabinet colleagues and from there, we will decide and determine the proper procedures and how we want to communicate this back to the Members. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Item 6, oral questions. The honourable Member for Great Slave, Mr. Braden.

#### Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

MR. BRADEN: Mr. Speaker, thank you. My question this morning is for the Minister responsible for Aboriginal Affairs,

Mr. Antoine. I would appreciate if the Minister could give the House some comment or background on the consequences of yesterday's landmark ruling in the federal court regarding the tax status of Treaty 8 people. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Braden. The honourable Minister responsible for the Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, Mr. Antoine

### Return to Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

HON. JIM ANTOINE: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I do not have anything official from our government yet. There was a court decision that was handed down yesterday in Edmonton, where a federal court judge has ruled that northern Alberta natives are exempt from a wide range of taxes as a result of verbal promises made during their treaty negotiations about 103 years ago.

The only thing I am reading from is from the newspaper, the Canadian press. I have as much information as Members of the House from the newspapers. I have asked the appropriate Minister of Justice to provide me with some legal review of the decision and get back to us on the consequences. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Braden.

### Supplementary to Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

MR. BRADEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I realize it is early days, but I will continue the line of questioning for the Minister. The consequences of this kind of thing are, financially, potentially significant. I am wondering if the Minister has any information regarding the potential impact of Treaty 8 recipients not paying tax on revenues and the cash flow for the Government of the Northwest Territories. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Braden. The honourable Minister responsible for the Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, Mr. Antoine.

### Further Return to Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

HON. JIM ANTOINE: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I am sure there are going to be some tax implications for people who are under Treaty 8, who are here in the Northwest Territories. The exact implication of this court ruling on behalf of these people is unknown to us at this point in time. We still have to look at the court documents and assess what remains and look at where we are.

I have to work with my colleagues in Cabinet to do that, so I do not have that information at this point in time. Thank you.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Braden.

# Supplementary to Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

MR. BRADEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Could the Minister advise whether there are other treaty agreements in the NWT that may take a lead from this and that may see this landmark

tax ruling extended to other First Nations groups in the NWT? Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Braden. I will exercise a bit of caution on that question. It may not be quite in the Minister's domain to know all of that, but I will allow the Minister to respond if he chooses. Mr. Antoine.

### Further Return to Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

HON. JIM ANTOINE: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, besides Treaty 8 in the Northwest Territories, we have Treaty 11. Those are the only two treaties that we have. However, the wording of the treaties is different from each other. At this point in time, whether Treaty 11 will enjoy the same benefits as a result of the court hearing is unknown. It is speculation at this point in time. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Final supplementary, Mr. Braden.

### Supplementary to Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

**MR. BRADEN:** Mr. Speaker, could the Minister commit to bringing some information back to this House before the end of this session? Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Braden. The honourable Minister responsible for the Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, Mr. Antoine.

# Further Return to Question 178-14(5): Treaty 8 Federal Court Tax Ruling

HON. JIM ANTOINE: Mr. Speaker, this is a ruling that just happened yesterday in Edmonton. We need time to review the consequences of it. It is a legal process that we have to find out and analyze. If we break by Wednesday, then that would be very soon. It would be really tough to do that. Whenever I get the information, even after this session is over, I will provide the information. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Item 6, oral questions. The honourable Member for North Slave, Mr. Lafferty.

#### Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

MR. LAFFERTY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. My question is for the Honourable Vince Steen, Minister of Municipal and Community Affairs. I would like to ask the Minister, regarding my statement where I talked about fair play and fair selection of athletes representing the Northwest Territories, during his official trip to the Arctic Winter Games, if he can make sure he speaks with the officials that are there and look towards setting up some sort of committee that can look at how we can select all of our teams in fairness? Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Lafferty. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Return to Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

HON. VINCE STEEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, in the past, there were opportunities for Ministers from different Arctic Winter Games jurisdictions to meet and discuss these particular types of issues. However, this time it will not be happening, more because the games are being held in two different places rather than all in one municipality.

What the plan is that this will actually take place later in the year, I believe it is in Alberta. We will be meeting to discuss all aspects of sports that are related to Arctic Winter Games, including allowing for fair competition and fair opportunity for all the athletes. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Lafferty.

### Supplementary to Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

MR. LAFFERTY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I am happy with the answer the Minister gave. I would also like to ask the Minister if he can make sure we are very well-represented by the smaller communities when they do make these decisions; if he can make that effort to contact the smaller communities who make a majority of all the finest athletes out there. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Lafferty. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Further Return to Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I can assure the Member that the department will work with that and I will be working with the department on that as well. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Lafferty.

### Supplementary to Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

MR. LAFFERTY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. In the past, we have heard of selection committees coming from the larger centres and that there is unfairness. I would like to ask the Minister, if we do set up a committee of some sort, that there will be fair representation from all over. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Lafferty. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Further Return to Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

HON. VINCE STEEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, this type of concern we will be trying to address through the meetings that we are going to be having with our other counterparts in Alberta. As well, there is a meeting in April whereby I will be meeting with all the sports organizations in the Territory. We will be discussing this particular type of suggestion put forward by the Member. I am sure we will be

able to come up with something that will address the whole issue of fair participation by everyone. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Final supplementary, Mr. Lafferty.

### Supplementary to Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

MR. LAFFERTY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. As the Regular Members are the ones who get all the complaints on all the issues, I would like to ask the Minister if he can involve some of the Regular Members when they do have this meeting in April. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Lafferty. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Further Return to Question 179-14(5): Arctic Winter Games Athlete Selection

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I certainly will put that forward to the department to see if we can accommodate having some of the Members come to Inuvik and take part in the discussions in April.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Item 6, oral questions. The honourable Member for Hay River North, Mr. Delorey.

### Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

**MR. DELOREY:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, my question today is for the Minister of Municipal and Community Affairs. It has to do with some of the actions we have taken in the House lately to do with small communities.

Mr. Speaker, I certainly do not want to speak against supporting anything for small communities, but it gives me some cause for concern when the riding I represent actually has three small communities within the riding. The three communities that fall within that riding are also part of a tax-based community. I would say they have as much need, maybe more, than the communities that are non-tax-based.

I was wondering if the Minister could inform the House as to how they look at small communities within a tax-based region/municipality as far as funding for special projects within those small communities? Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Delorey. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Return to Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I believe we have three communities that may fall within the category the Member is suggesting. In Yellowknife, it would be N'dilo and Detah. In the Member's riding, we would probably include the Hay River Reserve, if not Enterprise as well.

The point is that we have a program where these communities are entitled to just as much O and M and capital infrastructure

based on their population as we apply to any of those other non-tax-based communities.

In the case of the City of Yellowknife, for instance, the City of Yellowknife does take on some of the responsibilities of road maintenance in N'dilo, but I understand the community is still funded for this through the band. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Delorey.

# Supplementary to Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

MR. DELOREY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, just to clarify, the Hay River Reserve or Enterprise are not part of my riding or part of the tax-based community of Hay River, but Vale Island and West Channel are, which are two very distinct communities that are encompassed within the tax-based municipality.

I was wondering, Mr. Speaker, if the Minister could shed some light on whether during the block funding process that goes to the tax-based municipalities, are those small communities taken into consideration for extra funding for special projects within those small communities?

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Delorey. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

# Further Return to Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

HON. VINCE STEEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I do not believe the small communities are part of the larger community block funding, because they are in fact considered a community of their own, and they receive funding for capital separately from what the larger centre would receive. So the block funding Hay River receives does not include any capital for the Hay River Reserve, nor would it receive any funding for O and M because the Reserve is still considered separately on their own. They are entitled to their own funding.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Supplementary, Mr. Delorey.

### Supplementary to Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

MR. DELOREY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, if Vale Island in Hay River, which has a large number of kids now growing up there, want to have a sports facility and a community hall within that small group, because they are part of the tax-based community of Hay River, Hay River cannot afford to put one down there because the numbers do not justify it. Could the Minister of Municipal and Community Affairs assist with special funding to address that issue? Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Delorey. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

# Further Return to Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, I will have to take that one back to the department for review. I will get back to the Member as to whether we can assist at all. Thank you.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Final supplementary, Mr. Delorey.

### Supplementary to Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

MR. DELOREY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I wanted to raise this issue because there was a paper that went around yesterday for Members for this special committee on small communities, and I put my name forward. I think it is very important that these areas be taken into consideration. I would like to ask the Minister if he will commit to reviewing this specific area of small communities within a tax-based community. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Delorey. The honourable Minister responsible for the Department of Municipal and Community Affairs, Mr. Steen.

### Further Return to Question 180-14(5): Small Communities Within Tax-Based Municipalities

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, yes, I can commit to reviewing this and getting back to the Member as to whether or not we can assist the small communities within the larger communities. Thank you.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Minister. Item 6, oral questions. Are there any further oral questions? Item 7, written questions. Item 8, returns to written questions. Item 9, replies to the opening address. Item 10, petitions. Item 11, reports of standing and special committees. Item 12, reports of committees on the review of bills. Item 13, tabling of documents. Item 14, notices of motion. Item 15, notices of motion for the first reading of bills. Item 16, motions. Item 17, first reading of bills. The honourable Minister responsible for Finance, Mr. Handley.

#### **ITEM 17: FIRST READING OF BILLS**

#### Bill 11: An Act to Amend the Liquor Act

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker,

I MOVE, seconded by the honourable Member for Thebacha, that Bill 11, An Act to Amend the Liquor Act, be read for the first time. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Minister. There is a motion on the floor. The motion is in order. To the motion. Question has been called. All those in favour? Thank you. All those opposed? Thank you. The motion is carried. Bill 11 has had first reading. Item 17, first reading of bills. Item 18, second reading of bills. The honourable Minister responsible for Finance, Mr. Handley.

#### ITEM 18: SECOND READING OF BILLS

### Bill 9: Supplementary Appropriation Act, No. 3, 2001-2002

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker,

I MOVE, seconded by the honourable Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes, that Bill 9, Supplementary Appropriation Act, No. 3, 2001-2002, be read for the second time.

Mr. Speaker, this bill makes supplementary appropriations for the Government of the Northwest Territories for the 2001-2002 fiscal year. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Minister. There is a motion on the floor. The motion is in order. To the principle of the bill. Question has been called. All those in favour? Thank you. All those opposed? Thank you. The motion is carried. Bill 9 has had second reading and accordingly stands referred to the committee of the whole. Item 18, second reading of bills. Item 19, consideration in committee of the whole of bills and other matters; Bill 2, Bill 4, Bill 9, Committee Report 1-14(5), Committee Report 214(5) and Committee Report 314(5) with Mr. Delorey in the chair.

# ITEM 19: CONSIDERATION IN COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE OF BILLS AND OTHER MATTERS

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** I will call the committee of the whole to order. We have several matters to deal with; Bill 2, Bill 4, Bill 9, Committee Report 1.14(5), Committee Report 2.14(5) and Committee Report 3.14(5). What is the wish of the committee? Mr. Dent.

MR. DENT: Mr. Chairman, I would like to recommend that the committee continue consideration of Bill 2 and Committee Report 1-14(5), Committee Report 2-14(5) and Committee Report 314(5), to conclude the consideration of the budget for the Department of Public Works and Services. When we conclude that, we move into consideration of Bill 9.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Dent. Does the committee agree? The Chair will call a short break and come back to review Bill 2.

#### -- Break

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** I call the committee of the whole back to order. Before we call in the Minister and the witnesses I would like to clear up a point of order that was raised Thursday, March 7, 2002, by the Member for Range Lake, Ms. Lee.

#### Chair's Ruling

Yesterday, March 7, 2002, in committee of the whole, Ms. Lee rose on a point of order with respect to comments made by Mr. Bell during debate on a motion to amend Bill 7, An Act to Amend the Legislative Assembly Retiring Allowances Act and Supplementary Retiring Allowances Act.

In stating her point of order, Ms. Lee alleged that the Member for Yellowknife South had imputed false motives to other Members in contravention of Rule 23(i) of the Rules of the Legislative Assembly.

Ms. Lee stated, and I quote from page 1058 of the Unedited Hansard:

I read from a repeated statement by the Member of Yellowknife South that somehow, anyone here who opposes this pension is doing so for a political purpose, that we are taking a stance that is popular to the public. We are taking this stance because...it is imputing motive. It is imputing why we are taking this position we are taking. That we are doing this because this is what the public wants, but really inside, in the dark inside of our little hearts, we are really wanting this money. I have a great objection to

I have reviewed carefully Mr. Bell's comments contained on page 1057 of Unedited Hansard. In speaking to the motion to amend Bill 7, Mr. Bell stated:

There are two things that a Member can take fom this. You can vote no, condemn the pension and that way you will get the political upside and political credit for voting no. Or you can take the pension. I would suggest that possibly, in a politically perfect world, you could do both, which maybe the act of privacy would enable, but I do not think that is fair.

I can find nothing in Mr. Bell's comments stating, imputing or implied that suggest an imputation of false motive. Rather, Mr. Bell was simply stating his interpretation of the facts. Therefore, it is the ruling of the Chair that Ms. Lee does not have a point of order.

#### -- Applause

We will go on to Public Works and Services. Would the Minister like to bring in witnesses?

HON. VINCE STEEN: Yes, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Steen. Does the committee agree?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Sergeant-at-Arms, can you escort the witnesses in please? Mr. Minister, please introduce your witnesses for the record.

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. On my light is Mr. Bruce Rattray, deputy minister of Public Works and Services. On my left is Mike Aumond, director of petroleum products.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Steen. We are on page 5-17, petroleum products, operations expense. Mr. Krutko.

**MR. KRUTKO:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, my question to the Minister is in regard to the petroleum products division. I believe there are some three million litres of diesel fuel sitting in Fort McPherson.

I would like to ask the Minister, what is the department doing to either try to bring down that amount by allowing the communities to access it, and is there a possibility of the community of Fort McPherson being able to work out a negotiated, agreeable ability to access that fuel at a reasonable price? Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Steen.

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Mr. Chairman, the inventory of fuel in Fort McPherson is being used at this point in time to supply Tsiigehtchic. It is being held in case the present supplier, which is Arctic Dove out of Inuvik, cannot continue to offer a lower-priced product than we have.

We are holding it as inventory at this point in time. We are not considering any negotiated deal with Fort McPherson at this point. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Steen. Mr. Krutko.

MR. KRUTKO: Can the Minister tell me what the cost of this inventory is?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Steen.

**HON. VINCE STEEN:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I am going to have to ask Mr. Aumond if he might have that inventory figure with him.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Steen. Mr. Aumond.

**MR. AUMOND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The cost of the inventory in Fort McPherson is roughly about 55 cents per litre. There are about 1.9 million litres in inventory.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko.

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I asked for the amount, not how much. Do they have the actual figure of the cost to this government for having that fuel sit in Fort McPherson? What is the cost of fuel that is presently in those tanks? I am looking for a dollar value.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

MR. AUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. It is roughly \$1 million.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko.

**MR. KRUTKO:** Mr. Chairman, regarding the supply of Tsiigehtchic, how much of that 4.9 million litres is going to be used by the community of Tsiigehtchic?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

**MR. AUMOND:** Of the 1.9 million litres in Fort McPherson, Tsiigehtchic would use roughly 300,000 of it per year.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko.

**MR. KRUTKO:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. That leaves almost 4.6 million litres. My calculation of the cost is that, even if you add it up at 50 cents per litre, that is \$2 million.

-- Interjection

MR. KRUTKO: It is 1.9 million? I thought I heard him say 4.9 million. What are they going to do with the remaining amount of diesel fuel that is not being used by Tsiigehtchic?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. I think you may have heard the wrong figures there. Mr. Aumond, could you verify that?

MR. AUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. There are about 1.9 million litres of diesel fuel left in Fort McPherson at a cost of about 55 cents per litre, roughly just over \$1 million in inventory, of which Tsiigehtchic uses about 300,000 litres on average. The intent would be to supply Tsiigehtchic until that supply is fully drawn upon, and also to provide some fuel in the community of Fort McPherson should Arctic Dove not be able to supply either during freeze-up or break-up. Thank you, Mr. Chairman

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko.

**MR. KRUTKO:** Can you tell me what the mark-up cost is of this fuel? You are saying it costs you 55 cents per litre. Why is it that it is being sold in the community of Tsiigehtchic at about \$1.03 per litre?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

MR. AUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The current price for heating fuel in Tsiigehtchic is 88 cents. There is no mark up or profit that PPD takes on this product or any product. Between the commission rate we pay the local contractor, recovering our costs of maintaining the tank farm, a loss allowance and applicable taxes, that is how we calculate the price. There is no profit margin on any of the products that we sell in Tsiigehtchic.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko.

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. They are saying there is a 30 cent cost difference from what it is costing you to what you are charging the consumers, so there is 30 cents there from your cost. That is costing you 30 cents on every litre to sell to the consumer in Tsiigehtchic, the purchase price or the going price you have in Fort McPherson. Are you saying that it is 30 cents per litre to basically deliver fuel to Tsiigehtchic, from the price you purchase it for to the price it is being sold at the pumps?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

MR. AUMOND: Yes, Mr. Chairman, that is correct.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko.

MR. KRUTKO: In committee, I raised a question to the Minister regarding the possibility of opening up to the community of Fort McPherson negotiations to purchase fuel from the Government of the Northwest Territories through a negotiated process. The Minister assured me they were willing to look at that.

I would like to ask the Minister, where is that and what is being done to start these negotiations?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Steen.

HON. VINCE STEEN: Mr. Chairman, my response was in relation to that fuel becoming surplus, whereby Arctic Dove would continue to undersell us and we would see ourselves stuck with this inventory. However, at this point in time, we have not reached that point yet. We still have the fuel on hand to supply Tsiigehtchic and to supply Fort McPherson between break-up and freeze-up. Also, the fuel has a certain shelf life and we are going to have to take that into consideration as well. We have not reached the point yet where we are stuck with the fuel. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Minister. Mr. Krutko.

**MR. KRUTKO:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I would like to ask the Minister if he has any contingency plans for cleaning up that site and removing the tanks from Fort McPherson.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

MR. AUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We have already undertaken to take some environmental monitoring, and we have some environmental audits completed for that site in Fort McPherson. When we come to the point where we would look at decommissioning the site, then of course we would undertake to clean up that site and remediate it back to its original state. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko

**MR. KRUTKO:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. How much is going to be spent to clean up the site and how soon will it be done?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

**MR. AUMOND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. In terms of how much it is going to cost, we have yet to establish that figure, but certainly we will be responsible for remediating the site back to its original state. The timing of any remediation would coincide with the decommissioning of the site, which would include, as you stated earlier, removing the tanks and the rest of the infrastructure. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. We are on page 5-17, petroleum products, operations expense, total operations expense, \$860,000. Mr. Krutko.

**MR. KRUTKO:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I would like to ask the department if that also includes the removal of the roughly two-and-a-half mile pipeline that goes down to the...

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

MR. AUMOND: Yes, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Mr. Krutko.

MR. KRUTKO: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, for several years, there was an environmental audit done by this government with regard to looking at different things that had to

be cleaned up. That was one of the sites that was identified because it sits in a flood plain. There have been concerns raised by the community with regard to the location of this site. I would like to ask the department how soon and what is the cost of that clean up? Do you have a dollar value of what the cost will be?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Krutko. Mr. Aumond.

MR. AUMOND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. We do not have a cost of what the clean up would be right now. We will endeavour to take a risk assessment on that site this summer. That is what we have planned. We are still in the stages of discussing with RWED, who has the legislative responsibility to ensure that these sites are cleaned up, about where Fort McPherson would line up in terms of a priority vis-à-vis every other site that we have an obligation to remediate as well. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Aumond. Page 5-17, petroleum products, operations expense, total operations expense, \$860,000.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Information item, page 518, active positions. Page 519, lease commitments -- infrastructure. Mr. Lafferty.

**MR. LAFFERTY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Active positions in the North Slave area, can the Minister tell me how many are in the Dogrib North Slave area, in the Monfwi riding?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Lafferty. Mr. Rattray.

MR. RATTRAY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. At present, there are two positions in the communities the Member is referring to.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Rattray. Mr. Lafferty.

**MR. LAFFERTY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. What is the difference between headquarters and North Slave? Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Lafferty. Mr. Rattray.

MR. RATTRAY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Headquarters refers to those headquarters positions that provide services throughout the Territories. They are typically our corporate services group and our asset management technical support functions. It includes the systems and communications. We also have Mr. Aumond's office for the petroleum products division.

In the North Slave are the regional positions that are actually responsible for delivering services to the North Slave regional communities, including Yellowknife and the communities in the Member's riding.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Rattray. Page 5-19, information item, lease commitments, infrastructure.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Page 5-20, information item, systems and communications, chargeback.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Page 5-21, information item, systems and communications, active positions.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Page 5-22, information item, public stores revolving fund.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Page 5-23, information item, petroleum products revolving fund.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Page 5-24, petroleum products revolving fund, active positions.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Page 5-25, details of work performed on behalf of others, which is continued on page 5-27, total department, \$1,122,000.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Page 5-28, revenues, recoveries and transfer payments.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** We will go back to page 5-7, Public Works and Services, department summary, operations expense, total operations expense, \$41,324,000.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** We will go to the capital acquisition plan, Public Works and Services, capital, page 8, asset management, total asset management, \$800,000.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Systems and communications, total systems and communications, \$400,000.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Petroleum products, total petroleum products, \$2,650,000.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Total department, \$3,850,000.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Does the committee agree that that concludes the Department of Public Works and Services?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** I would like to thank the Minister and his witnesses for appearing. At this time the Chair will call a break so we can attend the activities out in the Great Hall.

--- Break

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** I would like to call the committee of the whole back to order. We will proceed with the review of Supplementary Appropriation, No. 3. Does the Minister have any opening comments? Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, Supplementary Appropriation, No. 3 requests authority for operations expenditure appropriations of \$6,429,136 and capital investment appropriations of \$997,000. These requirements are within the estimated supplementary reserves.

Major items included in the operations expenditure request are as follows:

- \$1.3 million for the salary and benefit increases resulting from the collective agreement between the NWTTA and the GNWT;
- \$879,000 for the increase in southern placements of children and adults in care;
- A total of \$685,000 for the establishment of two special committees of the Legislative Assembly;
- 4. \$421,000 for community governments and local housing associations for increases to the Northern Employee Benefits Services Pension Plan; and
- \$994,000 for grants-in-kind associated with the donation of staff houses to communities and band councils.

Also included in the operations expenditures is a reduction of \$1.1 million in previously approved funding for expenditures in support of the commercial vehicle trip permit fee.

The request for additional capital expenditures includes \$1.1 million for the Department of Transportation for the Mackenzie Winter Road Bridge Acceleration Program. This amount will be financed by advancing the current approved cash flow for the program.

Mr. Chairman, I am prepared to review the details of the supplementary appropriation requests. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Seeing as there is no review by a standing committee on this, we will go into it directly. Does the Minister wish to bring in any witnesses? Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Yes, I do, Mr. Chairman.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Does the committee agree?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Sergeant-at-Arms, please escort the witness in. Mr. Minister, please introduce your witness for the record.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, with me is Lew Voytilla, secretary to the Financial Management Board.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. We are here to review Bill 9. We will stand down the bill and deal with the detail booklet first. I will not be able to give you the page numbers. General comments on Bill 9. Detail. We will start with Legislative Assembly, operations expenditures, not previously authorized, Office of the Clerk, \$1,992,467. Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, could we get a breakdown of what is included in the \$452,467 associated with the conflict of interest complaint, please?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. There are three stages or phases in this particular allocation. That is, the Member conflict complaint, the Board of Management application and the Special Committee on Conflict Process. Within each of those there are expenditures.

In the expenditures, in compensation and benefits, there was a total of \$3,897.35 spent, which was during the Special Committee on Conflict Process. Travel and transportation, there was a total of \$9,865.15 spent. That was for Member conflict complaint and also for the Special Committee on Conflict Process. Materials and supplies totalled \$2,815.97. That was incurred in the Member conflict complaint and in the Special Committee on Conflict Process, with most of it being there.

Then on purchased services, there was a total of \$2,755.93 spent during the Special Committee on Conflict Process. On contract services, spent in each of the three phases, there was a total of \$433,131.75, for a total of \$452,466.15.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I have a couple of questions. Were all of the expenses that were associated with the conflict process, the special committee process, right through to the tabling of their report in this House, I believe it was October 23<sup>rd</sup>?

Second would be, could we get a breakdown of what the contract services relate to? I am assuming that is for lawyers, but could we get the specific clients that these services were provided for by the lawyers?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I believe this is the total. This is what was submitted to us by the Speaker's Office. In terms of the breakdown, then yes, by far, most of it is contract services for lawyers. I do not know if the Member is asking for a breakdown of that further. If he is:

- To Peterson, Stang and Malakoe, \$80,954.52. This is in support of the law clerk;
- For Carol Roberts, the Conflict Commissioner, \$30,515;

- Chivers, Greckol and Kanee, lawyers for Jane Groenewegen, \$88,556.57;
- Morley and Ross, lawyers for Carol Roberts, \$57,633.74;
- Lovett and Westmacott, lawyers for Carol Roberts, \$40,668.96;
- 6. Arvay Finlay, lawyers for Carol Roberts, \$84,137.57;
- 7. Hansard transcription, \$33,956.25;
- 8. Robert Marlow, \$4,375; and
- 9. Miscellaneous, \$12,334.14.

Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

MR. DENT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I just wanted to ascertain if this was the total for the cost of the special committee. Just a question, there seemed to be four different times where we heard of payments under contract services here for Carol Roberts. Were all of these related to the special committee's work, or were some of them related to different parts of the conflict process?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, we do not have a breakdown of exactly what it was used for, but I am assuming that some of it was related to the Member conflict complaint, some of it to the Board of Management application and some of it to the Special Committee on Conflict Process. The Speaker has not provided us with a breakdown of how much was spent on each area. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Legislative Assembly, operations expenditures, not previously authorized, Office of the Clerk, \$1,992,467.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Total department, \$1,992,467.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN** (Mr. Delorey): Executive, operations expenditures, Executive Offices, special warrants, Cabinet Secretariat, \$776,000. Mr. Roland.

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I would like a breakdown of what is included under the special warrant approved on January 21, 2002, for \$696,000.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handlev.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, for legal costs, and this is witnesses' legal costs, there was a total of \$161,562.17. For transition costs, which included compensation, benefits and other O and M, there was a total of \$533,975.22, for a total of \$695,537.40.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. On the transition costs, what makes up \$533,000?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The transition costs are made up of compensation and benefits, other O and M, which included some duplicate residence costs, and there was also some legal services with regard to the blind trust agreement.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Compensation and benefits, again under transition costs. How much of that makes up the \$533,000?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, the compensation and benefits portion of this is \$514,509.03.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: How many employees does that cover?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, it includes four people, including two secretarial staff.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. How did this \$514,000 break out between those four?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, as I say, there were two staff plus two secretarial people. To get into the detail on this one, this would, because we are really dealing with two staff, would probably be violating the Access to Information and Protection of Privacy Act. I gave the information to the committee yesterday in confidence and I do not think I can divulge it here. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

**MR. ROLAND:** Mr. Chairman, can the Minister quote under what section that this would be classified as confidential under that act?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handlev.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. It will just take me a minute to find the section, if you can bear with me.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** While we are waiting for Mr. Handley I will take a moment to recognize some visitors in the gallery. Welcome to the Chamber.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, It is in section 23, particularly 23(1). Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. In what particular manner would that be considered going against that particular portion of the act? These are public dollars that are being expended by public government, supposedly for the best interests of residents of the Northwest Territories. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, to give this information publicly would likely be an unreasonable invasion on a third party's personal privacy. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Could it not be considered an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy where the information relates to a third party's classification, salary range and discretionary benefits? If you look at all other positions within the Government of the Northwest Territories, for example, UNW employees, we know what range they would fall under and what category they would fall under for salaries and what termination benefits would be included in that. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, we are talking about a confidential termination contract and the terms of that, and without either an unreasonable invasion of the third party's personal privacy and also without having given them opportunity to intervene if they choose to, then it would not be right to divulge this information publicly. If the Member is asking about contracts and salary ranges, we can certainly talk about categories in that sense, but not specific information of this nature. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. However, is this not, in fact, if any details were to come out, they would be details of a discretionary benefit and not of a personal nature?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, this would be very personal information.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Again, this is a discretionary benefit we are speaking of, of a financial nature,

granted to the third party by a public body, so how could that be considered very personal?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, the government has entered into contractual obligations and it is incumbent on us to keep these settlement agreements confidential. To divulge this would be, I think, clearly a violation of the party's interests.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. So the Minister is stating that in fact, a public expenditure over \$514,000, over half a million dollars, is not of interest to the public of the Northwest Territories and should remain in the dark as to how these benefits were arrived at? Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, I am sure this is of interest to the public, but as I say, we have entered into settlement agreements and we have agreed to keep that confidential. The only way we would be able to agree to disclose the contents of those agreements would be subject to the third party notices that are required under the Access to Information and Protection of Privacy Act. We cannot disclose it otherwise. As I said, I did give the information on a confidential basis to the Members yesterday, but through the agreements we have entered into, we cannot disclose this without going back to the third party members. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. The Chair will recognize Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. It appears that we are going to have a bit of an ATIPP debate before we get into the actual details here. I would challenge the Minister's position on the legislation and reiterate what Mr. Roland has said, and that is that a disclosure of personal information is not an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy where the personal information relates to the third party's classification, salary range, discretionary benefits or employment responsibilities as an officer, employee or member of the public body, or as a member of the staff of a member of the Executive Council.

If there is any doubt as to whether or not we are talking about discretionary benefits, I can quote a letter which I am prepared to distribute to all of the Members that was dated November 17<sup>th</sup> from the Premier to the Standing Committee on Accountability and Oversight, in which he states:

I agree that the release of information concerning the chief of staff's classification, salary range, employment responsibilities and discretionary benefits does not constitute an unreasonable invasion of privacy and I am therefore prepared to report the following.

Under the discretionary benefits section, it says a listing is offered in Attachment A. Attachment A gets into leave, termination, performance, pay, et cetera. I would be prepared to distribute this letter from the Premier to our committee to all

Members in the House here to indicate that the Premier, in fact, agrees that this is not an unreasonable invasion of privacy.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, first of all, let me say that we could debate the provisions in ATIPP for a long time, probably because I think there is some uncertainty and various opinions of what can be released, but we do know that once private information is released, it cannot be recalled. I think that good prudence will tell us that we should at least give the third party an opportunity to intervene if they choose to do so. We should give them that opportunity.

With regard to the standard termination clauses, the agreement and so on, if we want to talk about those in general, then I do not think there is any difficulty, but to get into specific dollars may very well, and is most likely an invasion of personal privacy. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. This letter does not get into specific dollars. It talks about salary ranges and it talks about discretionary benefits. Could I distribute that to all Members of the House and witnesses?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Mr. Bell, was the letter you are referring to provided in confidence? Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. No, indeed, there is no confidential stamped on the letter. It was simply from the Premier to Charles Dent, the chair of the Standing Committee on Accountability and Oversight. He was sharing this information with Members of AOC. There is nothing stamped confidential on it.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Mr. Dent, would the committee have any difficulty with this letter being circulated? Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** Mr. Chairman, all Members of AOC have already received copies of the letter that Mr. Bell is referring to, and as Mr. Bell has said, the Premier says in the letter the information that is released is not subject to privacy conditions, so I do not see why there would be any objections to the circulation of the letter. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Mr. Bell, you can proceed to circulate the letter. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I have some questions about the original contracting process. I guess my first question for the Mnister, were the two former staff positions that form the bulk of the money that we are talking about, were these two positions employed pursuant to written contracts?

 $\textbf{CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):} \ Thank \ you, \ Mr. \ Bell. \ Mr. \ Handley.$ 

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Yes, Mr. Chairman, they each had a contract

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** Thank you. Can the Minister please tell me who had the authority on the part of the Executive to agree to these terms, or in fact negotiate them in the first place?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, the employment contract for the chief of staff was entered into pursuant to the general employment provision of the Public Service Act. In the case of the principal secretary, it would be the same arrangement. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. It is my understanding that in fact Cabinet did approve these contracts, but not in detail, and the detail of the terms of the contracts was in fact negotiated by the Premier. Is that correct?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, the general contract, the boilerplate contract, would have been approved by Cabinet. The negotiations of the contract would be done by the secretary to Cabinet and approved by the Premier in this case.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** Thank you. Can the Minister tell me if these contracts provided for benefits over and above the payment of salary, and if so, what were the benefits provided for?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, the benefits, in addition to salary, would have been as provided for through the excluded employees or managers handbook. They would be normal for these kinds of contracts.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I am wondering if the government obtained any legal advice with respect to the terms or conditions in either of these contracts before they were signed by the Premier.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, all of the boilerplate contracts would have been passed by Justice.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** But Justice would not have given specific legal advice or a legal opinion as to whether or not these two specific contracts complied?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** No, Mr. Chairman. That would not have happened with the original employment contracts.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** Thank you. You have indicated these were boilerplate type contracts. I am assuming that means they are standard deputy minister contracts, because we do not have other chiefs of staff or principal secretaries, so I am assuming he is speaking of deputy minister level contracts.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, these would be basically standard at pleasure contracts.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** So we have a standard at pleasure contract, typical to a chief of staff position that we have never had in this government before, is that correct?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, no, not specific to that position, but there are a lot of senior managers in government whose contracts are at pleasure, so we would have a boilerplate contract for those.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I would suggest to you that this one is significantly different. Would the Minister not agree?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** To my knowledge, no, it is not different than other at pleasure contracts. It would have similar provisions.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

**MR. BELL:** Can the Minister inform me as to how many other at pleasure contracts would have the degree of termination benefits that we have seen these two have?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, all of the deputy minister contracts, which are at pleasure contracts and probably, I do not know the exact number, three or four others, would have the same termination provisions.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

MR. DENT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. First off, I have a real problem with how this has been characterized in the supplementary appropriation as costs associated with the Special Committee on Conflict Process. There may be some argument that the \$161,500 in witness legal fees is related to the Special Committee on Conflict Process, but I have no understanding at all of how we could possibly lump what Mr. Handley has today called transition costs in as part of those costs. Could he give me some kind of explanation for that, please?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I think the resignations by these individuals was a fallout from the whole conflict process, and therefore, that is the reason they are put within this category. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

MR. DENT: Fallout from the whole conflict process. There are an awful lot of things that we could probably characterize as being fallout from that process, but I think that if anything, it is making it more difficult for the public to appreciate just what the expenditure is when you hide it under that term. I am not

convinced that is a proper way of putting this in. It should have been shown quite clearly as compensation and benefits on termination so there would be a better understanding on that. Who in the government normally negotiates and signs deputy minister contracts?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, these would normally be negotiated by the secretary to Cabinet and would be signed by the Premier.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

MR. DENT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The Minister is saying that the normal process was followed. In a letter I received today from the Minister, which provided a little more information on these contracts, he notes that the process followed was similar to the manner in which several senior level positions have been implemented, including that of the principal secretary. Can he tell me how many have not followed this process?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, to my knowledge, all of the at pleasure contracts would follow the same process and would have followed the same process.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** So the normal process is that the senior person in the bureaucracy would negotiate and, I assume, first sign off on the contract before presenting them to the Premier for signature, is that correct?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, I expect that the secretary to Cabinet, as a senior bureaucrat, would negotiate it, would probably initial it, but not likely sign it before it was presented to the Premier.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** The Minister has no reason to believe that was not the process that was followed, and that the secretary to Cabinet did in fact initial these contracts before they were presented to the Premier for signature?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, I do not know if she actually initialled them or what the form would be when she would hand them to the Premier. Certainly I expect that she would negotiate these and at some point present them to the Premier for signature.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

MR. DENT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I am not sure the committee is going to be happy to go along with presumptions. I suspect we will be considering this issue for a little while longer than today. Can the Minister undertake to get back to the committee to investigate what process was followed and let us know?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Yes, Mr. Chairman, I can do that.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

MR. DENT: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. In response to an earlier question about the authority to negotiate an employment contract, the Minister said that the employment contract fell under the general provisions of the Public Service Act. I am sure he knows there is a difference of opinion and the members of the Standing Committee on Accountability and Oversight felt very strongly that the chief of staff position was not covered by the Public Service Act. They made a very strong recommendation to the government to deal with that issue.

Does the Minister still insist that the authority was there, in spite of the committee's advice that we did not agree that it was? That we had some advice that the government needed to take action to amend the Public Service Act in order to allow for such a position to be part of the public service?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, yes, I would still take that position. She was in the public service. She had an at pleasure contract. She was not a restricted employee. I would still hold the same position.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Were the amounts that were paid out in compensation and benefits on termination consistent with the terms set out in the employment contract for resignation?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Chairman, the standard termination clause in at pleasure contracts reflects the norm and provides, in the case of no-cause termination, a severance payment of one month per year of service with a minimum of 12 months and a maximum of 24 months. That is pretty standard with those contracts. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** The Minister told me what the standard was. He did not tell me if these terminations were paid out based on what is in the contract for resignation.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, maybe I will let Mr. Voytilla explain that one rather than me attempt to explain the difference. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Voytilla.

MR. VOYTILLA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Mr. Handley has already gone through and provided what the standard boilerplate revision is in at pleasure contracts. In addition to that standard, depending on the circumstances, there can be an additional amount paid if the government deems that there is a potential legal liability, and we negotiate an additional

amount to avoid any potential suit or action brought against the government. That is a discretionary issue that is dealt with on a case-by-case basis. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Voytilla. Mr. Dent.

**MR. DENT:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Well, the Minister and Mr. Voytilla have told us things that we know, but the question I wanted answered was did the payments in this case follow the formula set out in the contract for a resignation? That can be answered, Mr. Chairman, with a simple yes or no.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Dent. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, they were within the contract. As I say, a standard contract provides for severance payment of one month per year of service with a minimum of 12 months and a maximum of 24 months. As Mr. Voytilla has said, in this case, there was an amount negotiated because of the particular circumstances and in order to avoid legal liability. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. The Chair will recognize Mr. Braden.

**MR. BRADEN:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Along the same line, I may be asking almost identical questions, but we are dealing with some fineness here in definition and understanding.

I would like to know, in the case of the principal secretary and the chief of staff, by the books, did they resign their positions or were they terminated? We have been using the same words in our discussions this afternoon. I would like to know, for the record, which definition applies to which of these people? Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Braden. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. In the case of one of these individuals, the position was done away with. The chief of staff position was done away with. Therefore, I suppose it would be termed, in effect, a termination because the job no longer existed. In the other case, it would be an involuntary resignation. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Braden.

**MR. BRADEN:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. In the case of Mr. Bayly then, an involuntary resignation, but a resignation nonetheless. What I am wondering here is, is there any kind of different consideration in the terms of separation, whether it is voluntary or involuntary? Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Braden. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, in the case of an involuntary or no-cause termination, then the provision I referred to before kicks in, which is a severance of one month per year and a minimum of 12 months. If it is just a voluntary resignation, then of course this particular clause would not necessarily kick in.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Braden.

MR. BRADEN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. In terms of negotiating and arriving at the terms of the agreements and the payouts, was anything considered for either position that was outside the terms of the contracts that were with these people? Were there any new considerations or unusual circumstances that may have been incorporated that were not included strictly in the terms of the contract? Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Braden. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, I think the considerations in arriving at a termination contract were clearly within the limits I have just mentioned. One month per year service, minimum of 12, maximum of 24, and also the other point which we have made, which is the need to avoid legal liability if possible. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Braden.

MR. BRADEN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Then to the process of negotiating once the decisions have been made, there needs to be some negotiation and some agreement. I would like to pursue just who was involved in these discussions and in these negotiations, I guess within the Executive and the officials involved from the public service. Is there a group of officials who would normally be called on to address these kind of resignations? If so, what would those positions be? Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Braden. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, normally what happens is that the secretary to Cabinet would be the person responsible, and in doing that, that individual would consult with FMBS because of their labour relations responsibilities, and potentially the Department of Justice, if there are legal issues to be considered. There is no reason to believe that these were not done in the standard way that this would be handled in any case. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Braden

MR. BRADEN: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Okay, no reason to believe that this was not done in these cases. Can the Minister provide further assurance that indeed these steps -- which would be a prudent way to go, you would want to have, I think, a number of pairs of ears and eyes on these kinds of things -- were good procedural steps taken to consider the terms of settlement, and were the normal contacts or checks and balances involved in the final settlement? Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Braden. Mr. Handlev.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, information that I have is that the normal processes were followed. The normal checks and balances were followed and there is no reason to believe otherwise, in my view.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you. I just want to be clear. I think the Minister already has answered this but I want to make sure I

was clear. Was any aspect of the payment made to the chief of staff discretionary or, in other words, not dictated by the terms expressly in the contract?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, the whole contract was negotiated. In terms of breaking it down into what specific pieces may be negotiated in what way, I think again we are getting into an area where we may be getting into violation of the Access to Information and Protection of Privacy Act if we give any more detail. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: The Minister indicated that there is a section that says should the GNWT terminate this position without cause, the GNWT will provide payment in lieu of notice of an amount equal to one month's salary, multiplied by a factor representing the number of years of service in any case that is not less than 12 or more than 24. So the amount paid out, does it represent the number of years of service or is it something over and above that?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, I cannot confirm that or answer that again without getting the third party's concurrence. I think to do that, again, would be a violation of ATTIP. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I disagree with the Minister's interpretation. I am not talking dollar amounts. I am simply asking, in this specific case, he indicated everything was within the contract. I am asking, did we adhere to multiplying the monthly wage by a number representing the number of years of service? I do not believe we did. I believe we did something over and above that and I am trying to get clarification. I am not talking dollar amounts. If the Minister will not answer it, I will ask the Law Clerk for an interpretation on this matter.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, as I said before, the factors taken into consideration is that clause I referred to, one month per year and so on, and the second piece that is taken into consideration in these kind of circumstances is the need to try to avoid legal liability. I believe Mr. Kakfwi may have something to add to this, Mr. Chairman, if I may.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Kakfwi, did you have some comments to make?

HON. STEPHEN KAKFWI: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. The suggestion I am going to make is that if there is interest and concern about the terms of employment of these former staff people, what the terms and conditions were, how were they arrived at and who negotiated them, as well as the conditions under which they left and the negotiation of these packages that the Members are expressing concern about, Members have already spent a good part of a morning going through this. The fact is that it is far better if they ask me about it and they ask the secretary to Cabinet, Liz Snider.

Mr. Handley was not involved in these things and he is not in any position to answer the questions that you are asking.

Nobody is denying the Members information. They simply should have asked and attended the sessions where the questions were asked yesterday. I know that Ms. Snider is prepared to answer the questions because she arrived at the contracts with the people involved and she, along with support staff, negotiated the severance packages, if that is what you call them, and brought them to me in both instances for signature.

If they want to know whether due process was followed and why those numbers are the way they are, it is far better for a committee to respect confidentiality and deal with it behind closed doors while we are talking about individuals and for public views, I think more than marginal about confidentiality.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Kakfwi. I guess on the process, Mr. Handley, any questions that you feel a need to refer to the Premier on, you could do that in this process. Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I would agree with the Premier that the secretary to Cabinet was involved in this process and could probably help us. I would certainly have no objection to her joining the witness table. The Minister responsible for the public service, the Minister of Finance, can already refer to the Premier. If Ms. Snider, as the secretary to Cabinet, was at the witness table, we would be able to get the information we need. I think there is a level of public scrutiny required here and I think it has to be done in an open and transparent manner.

We already have much of this information in a behind-closed-doors format. We are simply trying to verify some of that without jeopardizing confidentiality. You will notice that I am being very careful to only speak of positions and not names, and not get into specific dollar amounts. If Ms. Snider were to join us as a witness, I certainly would not take objection to that.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, I have no difficulty with having Ms. Snider at the witness table.

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Does the committee agree?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Agreed.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Would the Minister know if Ms. Snider is available to join at the witness table? Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, I do not know if she is available right now. I expect that she is. She was in the building and may in fact be down here in a few minutes. We will just check.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Committee members, we only have 10 minutes left in the sitting today, seeing as we are breaking at two o'clock. What is the wish of the committee? Mr. Bell.

MR. BELL: Thank you. I would like to ask this Minister something he is very familiar about, and that is as Minister responsible for the public service. I believe he withdrew himself from these matters because he felt he was in conflict, having been a member of the conflict committee. I would like to ask

the Minister specifically when he withdrew himself as Minister responsible for the public service?

CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey): Thank you, Mr. Bell. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, I withdrew myself from any Cabinet discussion on anything to do with the conflict process and related matters very early. I do not remember the exact month, but it was certainly at the time...probably before the conflict committee was set up. I may have been earlier because of my involvement on the Board of Management, but I withdrew myself from all matters on this very early in the process. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. The chair recognizes Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Just following up on my colleague's last question on the Minister's removal in this situation, in looking at the Public Service Act and seeing whose responsibility it is, I guess the first question is, before I get into the actual act itself, when the Minister stepped away from this situation or having any discussion, but to actually step away from responsibility as Minister responsible for the Public Service Act, was that a formal decision and was that rendered in writing?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, the Interpretation Act provides the authority for a Minister to act for or as another Minister. There is no formal procedure that governs how this would be performed or recorded. There is no formal process for it. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. So in fact, there was no formal decision that you are aware of that would put somebody else to act in your role as Minister responsible for the Public Service Act?

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, as I mentioned before, I removed myself from any discussions with regard to the whole conflict process very early on. These issues here, these matters before us here, were deemed to be related to the conflict process. The Premier, on the advice of senior staff, assumed that responsibility as Minister for the Public Service Act. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I guess I would be surprised that there would be no formal sort of discussion that this would flow, especially after the conflict process was concluded, a decision was rendered, the House had spoken and made decisions and end of report, is my understanding of any special committee work. That aside, Mr. Chairman, when I look at the Public Service Act and I refer to section 16 referring to appointments:

Subject to subsection 16.1(1) and 17(2) and (3), the Minister has the exclusive right and authority to appoint persons to positions in the public service.

It refers to "exclusive". This act would have priority over the Interpretation Act, which is just very general in nature. I would like to know if there are any other acts that would have this wording that the Minister has exclusive right and authority. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

HON. JOE HANDLEY: Mr. Chairman, I think that is correct, but the Interpretation Act allows for another Minister to act for or as the Minister with all the duties and responsibilities that go with that task.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. Mr. Roland.

MR. ROLAND: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Not being a lawyer myself, but seeing that this is a fairly precise wording, and the Interpretation Act, to my understanding, is general in nature and would allow for some flexibility, but I see this as being very specific. I would like to get an interpretation on this and which act would be over another if in fact the Interpretation Act would come over and supersede, in a sense, the Public Service Act in this terminology. Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Mr. Handley.

**HON. JOE HANDLEY:** Mr. Chairman, the Interpretation Act allows for one Minister to act for another. It does not take over or supersede for it. It simply allows for another Minister to act.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Handley. I am going to ask for a legal opinion on the act. Would it be okay to ask Ms. Peterson a legal opinion on that, Mr. Roland?

**MR. ROLAND:** Yes, Mr. Chairman, I would ask that the Law Clerk give us some information on this. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. Ms. Peterson.

**LAW CLERK (Ms. Peterson):** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I may have to ask Members for some time on this because of the situation. I think the Interpretation Act is perhaps more complex than it seems on first blush. Allow me to give you some initial thoughts on it.

Generally speaking, in statutory interpretation, when you have a piece of legislation that is specific in its nature and jurisdiction and there is a statute of general application where those two statutes are in conflict, the specific statute will prevail because it is dealing with the narrower and more specific approach.

The word "Minister" I think occurs fairly frequently throughout our statutes -- well, I know it occurs very frequently throughout our statutes. The Public Service Act is somewhat exceptional in granting to the Minister responsible for the public service exclusive authority.

Now, I have not done any historical research on that, but from a policy perspective, that makes sense because of the nature

of the position that the Minister occupies in that portfolio and the responsibility for public service. It is an area that particularly from a policy perspective, you want the responsibility to rest in one individual so that other individuals cannot sort of muck about, if I can put it that way, in employment matters. There are some fairly compelling reasons to restrain or keep within a fairly tight box the responsibility for the Public Service Act.

I think you need something in more detail and more refined than what I am giving you off the top of my head. With the permission of Members, I would like an opportunity to spend some time looking at that statutory interpretation. I think it is an important one for everyone here. I would like to have a look at it and get back to you as quickly as I can on it.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Ms. Peterson. Mr. Roland.

**MR. ROLAND:** Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I would gladly accept that and hope that we can have that information as we resume this come Monday. Thank you.

**CHAIRMAN (Mr. Delorey):** Thank you, Mr. Roland. The Chair will recognize the clock and will rise and report progress. I thank the Minister and his witness for appearing.

**MR. SPEAKER:** The House will come back to order. Item 20, report of committee of the whole. The honourable Member for Hay River North, Mr. Delorey.

#### ITEM 20: REPORT OF COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

**MR. DELOREY:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, your committee has been considering Bill 2 and Bill 9 and would like to report progress. Mr. Speaker, I move the report of the committee of the whole be concurred with.

MR. SPEAKER: Thank you, Mr. Delorey. Do we have a seconder for the motion? The honourable Member for Nahendeh, Mr. Antoine, seconds the motion. We have a motion on the floor. The motion is in order. All those in favour, please signify. Thank you. All those opposed? Thank you. The motion is carried. Item 21, third reading of bills. The honourable Member for Nunakput, Mr. Steen.

#### ITEM 21: THIRD READING OF BILLS

Bill 7: An Act to Amend the Legislative Assembly Retiring Allowances Act and the Supplementary Retiring Allowances Act

HON. VINCE STEEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker,

I MOVE, seconded by the honourable Member for Inuvik Twin Lakes, that Bill 7, An Act to Amend the Legislative Assembly Retiring Allowances Act and the Supplementary Retiring Allowances Act, be read for the third time. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Steen. We have a motion. The motion is in order. All those in favour, please signify. Thank you. All those opposed, please signify. Thank you. The motion is carried. Bill 7 has had third reading. Mr. Clerk, orders of the day.

#### ITEM 22: ORDERS OF THE DAY

**CLERK OF THE HOUSE (Mr. Hamilton):** Mr. Speaker, meetings immediately after adjournment today of the Standing Committee on Social Programs and Monday morning of the Standing Committee on Accountability and Oversight and Cabinet House Strategy.

Orders of the day for Monday, March 11, 2002:

- Prayer
- 2. Ministers' Statements
- Members' Statements
- 4. Returns to Oral Questions
- Recognition of Visitors in the Gallery
- Oral Questions
- 7. Written Questions
- 8. Returns to Written Questions
- 9. Replies to Opening Address
- 10. Petitions
- 11. Reports of Standing and Special Committees
- 12. Reports of Committees on the Review of Bills
- 13. Tabling of Documents
- 14. Notices of Motion
- 15. Notices of Motion for First Reading of Bills
- 16. Motions
- 17. First Reading of Bills
- Second Reading of Bills
  - Bill 11, An Act to Amend the Liquor Act
- Consideration in Committee of the Whole of Bills and Other Matters
  - Bill 2, Appropriation Act, 2002-2003
  - Bill 4, An Act to Amend the Legislative Assembly and Executive Council Act
  - Bill 9, Supplementary Appropriation Act, No. 3, 2001-2002
  - Committee Report 1-14(5), Standing Committee on Accountability and Oversight Report on the Review of the 2002-2003 Main Estimates
  - Committee Report 2-14(5), Standing Committee on Governance and Economic Development Report on the Review of the 2002-2003 Main Estimates

- Committee Report 3-14(5), Standing Committee on Social Programs Report on the Review of the 2002-2003 Main Estimates
- 20. Report of Committee of the Whole
- 21. Third Reading of Bills
- 22. Orders of the Day

**MR. SPEAKER:** Thank you, Mr. Clerk. Accordingly, this House stands adjourned until Monday, March 11, 2002, at 1:30 p.m.

-- ADJOURNMENT

The House adjourned at 2:07 p.m.